

Local freedom in the gravitational field revisited

María Jesús Pareja* and Malcolm A.H. MacCallum†

Abstract

Maartens *et al.* [1] gave a covariant characterization, in a 1+3 formalism based on a perfect fluid's velocity, of the parts of the first derivatives of the curvature tensor in general relativity which are “locally free”, i.e. not pointwise determined by the fluid energy momentum and its derivative. The full decomposition of independent curvature derivative components given in earlier work on the spinor approach to the equivalence problem enables analogous general results to be stated for any order: the independent matter terms can also be characterized. Explicit relations between the two sets of results are obtained. The 24 Maartens *et al.* locally free data are shown to correspond to the $\nabla\Psi$ quantities in the spinor approach, and the fluid terms are similarly related to the remaining 16 independent quantities in the first derivatives of the curvature.

1 Introduction and discussion of the general case

Maartens *et al.* [1] defined “locally free” terms in the curvature tensor and its first derivative, in general relativity, to be those not pointwise algebraically determined by the matter fields and their first derivatives. This definition can be extended in an obvious way to any order of differentiation. It is distinct from consideration of the free data in initial value problems for the Einstein equations, and from functional independence over the manifold or its frame bundle. Note that the quantities found at order n will in general be subject to differential equations (integrability conditions) at order $(n+1)$.

This definition can be related to the decomposition of the curvature tensor and its derivatives used in classifying metrics and testing their equivalence which is described, for example, in [2], chapter 9. The locally free

*Institute for Astronomy and Astrophysics, University of Tübingen, Auf der Morgenstelle 10, D-72076 Tübingen, Germany. Email: pareja@tat.physik.uni-tuebingen.de

†School of Mathematical Sciences, Queen Mary, University of London, Mile End Road, London E1 4NS, U.K. Email: m.a.h.maccallum@qmul.ac.uk

quantities and the matter terms together contain all the invariant classificatory information. Testing local isometry of two given spacetimes can be reduced to checking the consistency of a set of equations between the two Riemann tensors and their covariant derivatives, which for efficiency is best done using a canonically chosen frame.

For the curvature and first derivative in the perfect fluid case, Maartens *et al.* gave a covariant characterization, in a 3+1 formalism based on the invariantly-defined fluid velocity u^a , of the locally free quantities. (Note that full classification might need higher derivatives: for general energy-momenta, an example requiring the 5th derivative is known [5].) Their work was done with cosmology in mind. The electric and magnetic parts of the Weyl tensor defined relative to u^a , E_{ab} and H_{ab} , covariantly represent the locally free parts of the curvature.

Performing a complete covariant 1 + 3 decomposition of $\nabla_c E_{ab}$ and $\nabla_c H_{ab}$, where ∇_c denotes the covariant derivative in the c direction, into time derivatives, spatial curls, divergences and “distortions” (full definitions appear in the next section), it was shown that the locally free parts of the derivative of the curvature can be covariantly represented by the distortions and the spatial curls of E_{ab} and H_{ab} . These provide 24 free data. The relations that constrain the remaining first derivatives are the Ricci and Bianchi identities, which imply that the remaining parts of the derivatives of E_{ab} and H_{ab} are not locally free.

MacCallum and Åman [3] showed, using a two-component spinor formalism, that in any spacetime a minimal set of components of the derivatives of the Riemann curvature of a given order m can be specified such that all components of the derivatives of the Riemann curvature of order n can be expressed algebraically in terms of these sets for $m \leq n$. This generalized a result by Penrose [4] to the non-vacuum case. They also gave a specific prescription for these sets. The chosen quantities are formed by totally symmetrized spinor derivatives and contractions. Terms not in the minimal sets can be calculated using the Ricci and Bianchi identities and consequent higher order integrability conditions, which are the only equations relevant in the most general case. The Bianchi identities take the form

$$\nabla_{C'}^D \Psi_{ABCD} = \nabla_{(C}^{D'} \Phi_{AB)C'D'} , \quad (1)$$

$$\nabla^{BB'} \Phi_{ABA'B'} = -3\nabla_{AA'} \Lambda . \quad (2)$$

The chosen minimal set for the components of the Riemann tensor and its derivatives up to the n -th, which we denote collectively by $\nabla^n R$, can be described as follows [3], using the Newman–Penrose quantities Ψ_{ABCD} , $\Phi_{ABA'B'}$

and Λ , and defining a ‘totally symmetrized’ spinor to be one symmetrized over all its free dashed indices and also over all its free undashed indices. We take the following components for $n \geq q \geq 0$:

- (i) The totally symmetrized q th derivatives of Ψ_{ABCD} .
- (ii) The totally symmetrized q th derivatives of $\Phi_{ABA'B'}$.
- (iii) The totally symmetrized q th derivatives of Λ .
- (iv) For $q \geq 1$, the totally symmetrized $(q - 1)$ th derivatives of

$$\Xi_{ABCD'} \equiv \nabla_{(C}^{D'} \Phi_{AB)C'D'} (= \nabla_{D'}^D \Psi_{DABC}) \quad (3)$$

which is one side of (1).

- (v) For $q \geq 2$, the d’Alembertian $\nabla^{AA'} \nabla_{AA'}$ applied to all the quantities calculated for the derivatives of order $q - 2$.

It is worth recalling that the symmetrization removes all trace terms. The number of n -th derivative terms in this set in a general spacetime is $(n + 1)(n + 4)(n + 5)$, which is less, and for large n much less, than the total number of components of the n th derivatives of the independent components of the Riemann tensor, 20×4^n . Particular cases may satisfy some restrictions on the algebraic structure of the Weyl and Ricci tensors and/or differential identities which reduce the number of free quantities.

It is immediately obvious that the locally free data up to order n are given by the terms of type (i) and those of type (v) obtained from them, for all forms of matter and all values of n .

In the remainder of this paper we examine the relationship between the above set for $n = 1$ and the results of Maartens *et al.* The separation of locally free and matter terms is not unique, since linear independence is not affected by addition of other terms to the independent quantities. The two methods described above turn out to lead to different linear combinations of terms, but, as one would expect, the locally free data sets agree modulo terms which are not locally free.

Following [1], we restrict ourselves to the case where the matter content is a perfect fluid, which is of special importance in an astrophysical context. This reduces the number of independent components in the matter tensor from 10 to 5 (the density, pressure and three of the components of the 4-velocity), and the number of first derivatives correspondingly from 40 to 20, in both cases subject to the 4 contracted Bianchi identities, leaving 36 and 16 free components respectively. Choosing an orthonormal tetrad such that its timelike basis vector is aligned with the 4-velocity u^a , the number of independent non-zero components in the energy-momentum reduces to

2. The Weyl tensor has 10 independent components: 16 of their derivatives are fixed by the Bianchi identities and the remaining 24 are locally free (and correspond to the 24 terms of type (i) above for $n = 1$).

To make the correspondence one needs to represent u^a in the spinor formalism. The obvious way, with the usual correspondence between the spinor basis and a null basis ([2], § 3.6), is to choose the null tetrad so that the real null basis vectors are coplanar with u^a ; this implies the choice of two basis vectors, rather than the one fixed in the 1+3 form. To reflect this choice in the 1+3 system then requires a choice of a spacelike vector. For simplicity we deal with this by embedding the 1+3 approach in an orthonormal tetrad formalism, and relating that explicitly to the null tetrad as in [2], (3.12). The proof of the correspondence between the two sets of results described above is then a direct calculation on components. The relations are nevertheless tensorial in character: the choice of bases is no more restrictive than proving tensor equations by checking them in a specific coordinate basis. Note that we have not made an invariant choice of the spatial vectors, so this method does not correspond to carrying out the procedure for choosing a frame in the equivalence problem.

In section 2 we give the results of [1] in more detail, and in section 3 those of [3]. Section 4 links the two as outlined above. Throughout we follow the notation and conventions of [2], unless otherwise stated. We find as expected that the Maartens *et al.* [1] locally free data correspond with the 24 free components of type (i) above. The 16 remaining parts of the first derivative of the Riemann tensor ∇R , similarly correspond with the 16 algebraically independent quantities which occur in (ii) to (iv) in the perfect fluid case.

If the 1 + 3 decomposition via Young tableaux and removal of trace terms, as described in § 3 of [1], were carried out for $n > 1$, the results could similarly, if laboriously, be compared with the prescription (i)-(v) above.

2 Covariant 1 + 3 characterization of the *locally free* parts of the Riemann tensor and its covariant derivative

The energy-momentum tensor for perfect fluid is $T_{ij} = (\mu + p)u_i u_j + pg_{ij}$, where p denotes the pressure and μ the energy density. We shall assume that $\mu + p \neq 0$, so that the 4-velocity u^a is well and covariantly defined. (In the case $\mu + p = 0$ where the 4-velocity is indeterminate, the matter being just a cosmological constant, the kinematic quantities below are also

indeterminate.)

Projecting the covariant derivatives of u^a parallel and orthogonal to it, using $h_{ab} = g_{ab} + u_a u_b$, we obtain the spatial “kinematic quantities” Θ (expansion), $\dot{u}_a$ (4-acceleration), ω_{ab} (vorticity) and σ_{ab} (shear):

$$\begin{aligned} u_{a;b} &= \omega_{ab} + \sigma_{ab} + \frac{1}{3}\Theta h_{ab} - \dot{u}_a u_b, \\ \dot{u}_a &:= u_{a;b} u^b = Du_a/d\tau, \quad \dot{u}_a u^a = 0, \quad \omega_{ab} := u_{[a;b]} + \dot{u}_{[a} u_{b]}, \quad \omega_{ab} u^b = 0, \\ \sigma_{ab} &:= u_{(a;b)} + \dot{u}_{(a} u_{b)} - \frac{1}{3}\Theta h_{ab}, \quad \sigma_{ab} u^b = 0, \quad \Theta := u^a{}_{;a}. \end{aligned}$$

Using the covariant 3-dimensional permutation tensor $\eta_{abc} \equiv \eta_{abcd} u^d$, we define the vorticity vector $\omega_a \equiv \eta_{abc} \omega^{bc}$.

Using the field equations, the trace-less Ricci tensor $S_{ab} = R_{ab} - \frac{1}{4}Rg_{ab}$ and the curvature scalar are related to the perfect fluid quantities by

$$S_{44} = \frac{3}{4}(\mu + p), \quad S_{\alpha\beta} = \frac{1}{4}(\mu + p)h_{\alpha\beta}, \quad \text{and} \quad R = \mu - 3p,$$

where components in the u^a direction are labelled 4 and those orthogonal to u^a by Greek indices, $\alpha, \beta \in \{1, 2, 3\}$. These parts of the curvature are not locally free; the locally free parts are the electric and magnetic parts of the Weyl tensor, $E_{ab} \equiv C_{acbd} u^c u^d$ and $H_{ab} \equiv \frac{1}{2}\eta_{acd} C^cd{}_{be} u^e$, which satisfy $E_{ab} = E_{\langle ab \rangle}$ and $H_{ab} = H_{\langle ab \rangle}$, where angle brackets $\langle \dots \rangle$ denote the totally symmetrized, trace-free and spatially projected part, e.g. $T_{\langle ab \rangle} \equiv h_{(a}{}^c h_{b)}{}^d T_{cd} - \frac{1}{3}h_{cd} T^{cd} h_{ab}$, and round brackets denote symmetrization.

We denote the partial derivative by a comma, and covariant derivative by a semicolon. $\tilde{\nabla}$ will denote the projected covariant derivative operator ∇ , in which all indices of the resulting quantity are projected with h_{ab} . The tilde is to remind us that this derivative acts in a spatial section only when the vorticity vanishes, while the ∇ reminds us of the usual notation in three-dimensional vector calculus. Then the derivative of any traceless symmetric tensor B_{ab} has the following covariant decomposition [1]:

$$B_{ab;c} = -\dot{B}_{\langle ab \rangle} u_c - 2u_{(a} B_{b)d} \dot{u}^d u_c + 2u_{(a} \{B_{b)\}{}^d (\sigma_{dc} + \omega_{dc}) + \frac{1}{3}\Theta B_{b)c}\} + \tilde{\nabla}_c B_{ab}. \quad (4)$$

Defining the divergence, curl and distortion of B_{ab} respectively by

$$(\widetilde{\text{div}} B)_a \equiv \tilde{\nabla}^b B_{ab}, \quad (\widetilde{\text{curl}} B)_{ab} \equiv \eta_{cd(a} \tilde{\nabla}^c B_{b)}{}^d, \quad \tilde{\nabla}_{\langle c} B_{ab \rangle},$$

we have

$$\tilde{\nabla}_c B_{ab} \equiv \tilde{\nabla}_{\langle c} B_{ab \rangle} + \frac{3}{5}(\widetilde{\text{div}} B)_{\langle a} h_{b \rangle c} - \frac{2}{3}(\widetilde{\text{curl}} B)_{d(a} \eta_{b)c}{}^d. \quad (5)$$

The Bianchi identities (with perfect fluid), covariantly split, are:

$$\dot{\mu} + (\mu + p)\Theta = 0, \quad (6)$$

$$\tilde{\nabla}_a p + (\mu + p)\dot{u}_a = 0, \quad (7)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \dot{E}_{\langle ab \rangle} + \Theta E_{ab} - (\widetilde{\text{curl}} H)_{ab} - 3\sigma_{c\langle a} E_{b \rangle}^c + \omega_{d\langle a} E_{b \rangle}^d - 2\dot{u}^c \eta_{cd\langle a} H_{b \rangle}^d \\ = -\frac{1}{2}(\mu + p)\sigma_{ab}, \end{aligned} \quad (8)$$

$$\dot{H}_{\langle ab \rangle} + \Theta H_{ab} + (\widetilde{\text{curl}} E)_{ab} - 3\sigma_{c\langle a} H_{b \rangle}^c + \omega_{d\langle a} H_{b \rangle}^d + 2\dot{u}^c \eta_{cd\langle a} E_{b \rangle}^d = 0, \quad (9)$$

$$(\widetilde{\text{div}} E)_a - \eta_{abc}\sigma^b{}_d H^{cd} + 3H_a{}^b \omega_b = \frac{1}{3}\tilde{\nabla}_a \mu, \quad (10)$$

$$(\widetilde{\text{div}} H)_a + \eta_{abc}\sigma^b{}_d E^{cd} - 3E_a{}^b \omega_b = (\mu + p)\omega_a, \quad (11)$$

where the dot indicates the covariant derivative along the fluid 4-velocity.

The covariant derivatives of the matter terms are

$$S_{44;c} = \frac{3}{4}(\mu + p)_{,c}, \quad S_{\alpha\beta;c} = \frac{1}{4}(\mu + p)_{,c} h_{\alpha\beta},$$

$$S_{\alpha 4;4} = -(\mu + p)\dot{u}_\alpha, \quad S_{\alpha 4;\beta} = -(\mu + p)(\omega_{\alpha\beta} + \sigma_{\alpha\beta} + \frac{1}{3}\Theta g_{\alpha\beta}),$$

$$R_{;c} = (\mu - 3p)_{,c}.$$

Thus, the parts of ∇R determined pointwise by the matter (via the Bianchi identities) can be covariantly (1 + 3) characterized by 16 fluid variables. These can be chosen from the 8 derivatives of μ and p , the 5 components of σ_{ab} , the 3 each of ω_a and $\dot{u}_c$, and Θ , by eliminating 4 determined from the others by the contracted Bianchi identities (6) and (7). We may also note that all the kinematic quantities are covariantly defined by ratios of matter derivatives to $\mu + p$, which is itself defined by the Ricci tensor. If the spatial axes were determined, e.g. as eigenvectors of σ_{ab} , the remaining components of the kinematic quantities are then determined by Cartan invariants in the sense of [2]. These details are not discussed in [1].

We observe that the divergences of the locally free fields E_{ab} and H_{ab} are determined pointwise by the matter terms and the locally free fields via the Bianchi constraint identities (10) and (11). The curls of the locally free fields, together with the matter terms and the fields themselves, determine the time derivatives of E_{ab} and H_{ab} via the Bianchi evolution identities (8) and (9). The distortions $\tilde{\nabla}_{\langle c} E_{ab \rangle}$ and $\tilde{\nabla}_{\langle c} H_{ab \rangle}$ are exactly the parts of $\nabla_c E_{ab}$ and $\nabla_c H_{ab}$ which are missing from the (Ricci and) Bianchi identities, and do not locally depend algebraically on the matter fields. Therefore the distortions and curls of the electric and magnetic parts of the Weyl tensor provide a covariant characterization of the locally free parts of the derivative of the curvature tensor.

Since the distortions contain $2 \times 7 = 14$ independent components and the curls contain $2 \times 5 = 10$ independent components, there are at each point of the spacetime, in general, 24 components of $\nabla_e C_{abcd}$ and thus of $\nabla_e R_{abcd}$ *not constrained* algebraically by the matter terms.

3 Characterization of the Riemann spinor and its derivative

At $q = 0$ the split given earlier just tells us that the Riemann tensor splits into a locally free part Ψ_{ABCD} and matter parts $\Phi_{ABA'B'}$ and Λ . The minimal set of spinor first derivatives is:

- (i) the totally symmetrized spinor derivative of the Weyl spinor

$$\nabla_{(X}{}^{X'}\Psi_{ABCD)} ,$$

- (ii) the totally symmetrized spinor derivative of the Ricci spinor

$$\nabla_{(X}{}^{(X'}\Phi_{AB)}{}^{A'B')} ,$$

- (iii) the spinor derivative of the scalar curvature

$$\nabla_X{}^{X'}\Lambda ,$$

- (iv) the ‘curl’ $\Xi_{CABC'}$ of the Ricci spinor defined as in (3).

This minimal set has 60 independent quantities, whereas the total number of components is 80. The specialization of (ii)-(iv) for a perfect fluid is deferred to the next section.

Hereafter we follow the convention that components of totally symmetrized spinors are labelled by one primed and one unprimed index whose numerical values count those spinor indices which are projected onto the spinor basis element ι or its conjugate, so that, for example, we write

$$\nabla\Psi_{20'} \equiv \nabla_{(A|X'}\Psi_{|BCDE)}o^A o^B o^C \iota^D \iota^E \bar{o}^{X'}.$$

4 Correspondence between the covariant 1 + 3 and spinor decompositions of ∇R .

We denote the orthonormal tetrad¹ by $\{e_a{}^i\}$ where later Latin indices i, j now refer to coordinate components, and its dual covector basis by $\{\omega^a{}_i\}$.

¹The notation here is changed from that of [2] to avoid confusion between components of the tetrad and of the electric part of the Weyl tensor

The timelike basis vector is chosen to be the fluid 4-velocity, so $u^i = e_4^i$ and $u_i = -\omega^4_i$. In the spinor (null tetrad) approach we use a null tetrad $\{m^i, \bar{m}^i, l^i, k^i\}$ such that the fluid 4-velocity is $e_4^i = u^i = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(k^i + l^i)$.

Accordingly, we consider the ONT - null tetrad transformation

$$\begin{aligned} m^i &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(e_1^i - i e_2^i) & \bar{m}_i &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\omega^1_i + i \omega^2_i) \\ \bar{m}^i &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(e_1^i + i e_2^i) & m_i &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\omega^1_i - i \omega^2_i) \\ l^i &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(e_4^i - e_3^i) & -k_i &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\omega^4_i - \omega^3_i) \\ k^i &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(e_4^i + e_3^i) & -l_i &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\omega^4_i + \omega^3_i), \end{aligned} \quad \text{and its dual} \quad (12)$$

so that the metric written in terms of the null tetrad is

$$g_{ij} = 2m_{(i}\bar{m}_{j)} - 2k_{(i}l_{j)}.$$

When we restrict ourselves to the special case of perfect fluid source this choice will lead to restrictions on the algebraic structure of the Ricci spinor, and consequent differential identities. One obtains the following relations among the components of the Ricci spinor

$$\Phi_{11'} = \frac{1}{2}\Phi_{00'}, \quad \Phi_{22'} = \Phi_{00'}, \quad \Phi_{ab'} = 0 \quad \forall a \neq b \quad (a, b \in \{0, 1, 2\}).$$

There is only one independent component in $\Phi_{ABA'B'}$, whose relation with the fluid pressure and energy density is $\Phi_{00'} = \frac{1}{4}(\mu + p)$. There is also the curvature scalar $\Lambda = \frac{1}{24}R = \frac{1}{24}(\mu - 3p)$.

To complete the correspondence of the (1+3) and spinor decompositions of the curvature part of ∇R , we define²

$$Q_{ac} \equiv C_{abcd}^* u^b u^d = E_{ac} + iH_{ac}, \quad (13)$$

where C_{abcd}^* is the self-dual part of the Weyl tensor. Then we have

$$\begin{aligned} C_{abcd}^* &= 8u_{[a}Q_{b][d}u_{c]} + 2g_{a[c}Q_{d]b} - 2g_{b[c}Q_{d]a} \\ &\quad + 2i\varepsilon_{abef}u^e u_{[c}Q_{d]}^f + 2i\varepsilon_{cdef}u^e u_{[a}Q_{b]}^f. \end{aligned} \quad (14)$$

The spinor equivalent of C_{abcd}^* is $\varepsilon_{A'B'}\varepsilon_{C'D'}\Psi_{ABCD}$. Contracting with basis vectors we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \Psi_0 &= (Q_{11} - Q_{22} - 2iQ_{12})/2, & \Psi_1 &= (iQ_{23} - Q_{13})/2, & \Psi_2 &= Q_{33}/2, \\ \Psi_4 &= (Q_{11} - Q_{22} + 2iQ_{12})/2, & \Psi_3 &= (iQ_{23} + Q_{13})/2. \end{aligned} \quad (15)$$

²Changing the sign of Q as compared with [2].

4.1 Correspondence between the “locally free” parts of the first derivatives

The locally free parts in spinor form as chosen above, the terms $\nabla\Psi_{ab'}$, are linear combinations of distortions and curls of E_{ab} and H_{ab} (i.e. of Q_{ab}), which are the independent locally free parts in the $1 + 3$ form as chosen by [1], together with time derivatives of E_{ab} and H_{ab} and products of kinematic quantities with E_{ab} and H_{ab} . The time derivatives are determined from matter terms and curls of E_{ab} and H_{ab} via the Bianchi evolution identities (8) and (9), and the kinematic quantities are matter terms, so these parts are not locally free. The divergences of E_{ab} and H_{ab} do not appear in the $\nabla\Psi$.

We can obtain these results, which are independent of the perfect fluid assumption, as follows. Differentiating the spinor form of C_{abcd}^* gives just derivatives of Ψ , whereas differentiating (14) gives combinations of $\nabla_c E_{ab}$, $\nabla_c H_{ab}$ and products of kinematic quantities with E_{ab} and H_{ab} . That the 12 locally free complex terms $\nabla\Psi_{ab'}$ of type (i) above give the 24 real $(1 + 3)$ locally free quantities, modulo terms which are not locally free, and vice versa, can then be shown explicitly.

To do this, we note first that the $\Psi_{ab'}$ are rather simple combinations of the $\Psi_{ABCD;EE'}$. For example, using $_{,m}$ and $_{;m}$ for partial and covariant derivative, respectively, in the $\mathbf{m}$ direction, etc, we find $\nabla\Psi_{21'} = (3\Psi_{0011;m} + 2\Psi_{0001;\ell})/5$. We write the $(1 + 3)$ quantities in terms of Q_{ab} : real and imaginary parts can readily be separated as a final step. As the independent components of $Q_{\langle abc \rangle}$ we take the terms $Q_{\langle 111 \rangle}$, $Q_{\langle 112 \rangle}$, $Q_{\langle 113 \rangle}$, $Q_{\langle 123 \rangle}$, $Q_{\langle 122 \rangle}$, $Q_{\langle 222 \rangle}$, and $Q_{\langle 223 \rangle}$, and as the independent components of curl Q the terms $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{12}$, $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{23}$, $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{31}$, $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{11}$, and $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{22}$. Using (15), we then obtain

$$\begin{aligned} 2\sqrt{2}\nabla\Psi_{00'} &= (\widetilde{\nabla}_{\langle 3} Q_{11 \rangle} - \widetilde{\nabla}_{\langle 3} Q_{22 \rangle} - 2i\widetilde{\nabla}_{\langle 3} Q_{12 \rangle}) + (\dot{Q}_{11} - \dot{Q}_{22} - 2i\dot{Q}_{12}) \\ &\quad + \frac{4}{3}(\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q)_{12} - \frac{2i}{3}((\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q)_{11} - (\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q)_{22}) \\ &\quad + \text{matter terms} \times (E_{ab}, H_{ab}), \end{aligned} \tag{16}$$

and 11 other complex equations. Displaying these in full would be lengthy without being illuminating, so we omit the rest.

We now have to show the linear independence claimed. We give an abbreviated description of the results. The symbol $\cong$ will mean equality modulo $\dot{Q}_{ab}$ and products of kinematic quantities with Q_{ab} , which are not considered locally free derivative terms in either approach.

On taking the combinations $\nabla\Psi_{k0'} \pm \nabla\Psi_{(5-k)1'}$, $k = 0, 1, \dots, 5$, the expressions for $\nabla\Psi$ separate into 4 groups of 3 equations, two from each of two sets of 6 components, which can be solved for the 1 + 3 locally free quantities. Using the notation $(30' - 21')$ for the difference of $\nabla\Psi_{30'}$ and $\nabla\Psi_{21'}$, and so on, we find that: $(00' - 51')$, $(11' - 40')$ and $(20' - 31')$ give $Q_{\langle 113 \rangle}$, $Q_{\langle 223 \rangle}$, and $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{12}$; $(00' + 51')$, $(11' + 40')$ and $(20' + 31')$ give $Q_{\langle 123 \rangle}$, $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{11}$ and $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{22}$; $(21' - 30')$, $(10' + 41')$ and $(01' + 50')$ give $Q_{\langle 111 \rangle}$, $Q_{\langle 122 \rangle}$ and $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{23}$; and $(21' + 30')$, $(10' - 41')$ and $(01' - 50')$ give $Q_{\langle 112 \rangle}$, $Q_{\langle 222 \rangle}$ and $\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{31}$; and conversely.

As an example we give the structure for one of these groups of equations. The equations $(21' - 30')$, $(10' + 41')$ and $(01' + 50')$ are respectively

$$5\sqrt{2}(\nabla\Psi_{21'} - \nabla\Psi_{30'}) \cong -(5Q_{\langle 111 \rangle} + 5Q_{\langle 122 \rangle} + \frac{4}{3}\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{23}), \quad (17)$$

$$5\sqrt{2}(\nabla\Psi_{10'} - \nabla\Psi_{41'}) \cong 5Q_{\langle 111 \rangle} + 5Q_{\langle 122 \rangle} - \frac{8}{3}\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q_{23}, \quad (18)$$

$$\sqrt{2}(\nabla\Psi_{01'} + \nabla\Psi_{50'}) \cong Q_{\langle 111 \rangle} - 3Q_{\langle 122 \rangle}. \quad (19)$$

For this triple the $(1 + 3)$ derivatives are easily seen to be independent combinations of the left sides of the equations. The same is true for the other three sets.

Equation (16) gives one of the locally free spinor derivatives in terms of $(1 + 3)$ locally free quantities (two real equations). We end this section with examples from the converse set. We find

$$\widetilde{\nabla}_{\langle 2} Q_{11 \rangle} \cong \frac{2\sqrt{2}i}{3}(\nabla\Psi_{10'} + 3\nabla\Psi_{01'} - 2\nabla\Psi_{21'} - 2\nabla\Psi_{30'} - \nabla\Psi_{41'} - 3\nabla\Psi_{50'}),$$

$$(\widetilde{\text{curl}} Q)_{13} \cong \frac{5\sqrt{2}i}{4}(\nabla\Psi_{10'} + \nabla\Psi_{21'} + \nabla\Psi_{30'} - \nabla\Psi_{41'}),$$

and 10 similar complex (20 more real) equations.

4.2 Identifying the matter derivatives in ∇R

The 16 matter variables in $(1 + 3)$ form (given by the 8 $\{\widetilde{\nabla}_a \mu, \dot{\mu}, \widetilde{\nabla}_a p, \dot{p}\}$; 6 $\{\sigma_{ab}, \Theta\}$, 3 $\dot{u}_c$ and 3 ω_a , making 20 of which 4 can be eliminated by the contracted Bianchi identities (6) and (7)), which give the non-locally free derivatives in ∇R for the perfect fluid case, will now be shown to be fully equivalent to the 16 free quantities in the spinorial treatment, (ii) $\nabla\Phi$, (iii) $\nabla\Lambda$ and the matter form of (iv) Ξ . In the general case, the 36 real terms in these spinor components are all independent, but the restriction to a perfect fluid introduces linear dependencies between the components.

In the quantities (iv) in Section 3, $\Xi_{CABC'}$ (either side of the Bianchi identities (1)), there are, in general 8 complex (16 real) independent components. For our case, when these are calculated as the right hand side of (1), i.e. from the matter terms, these will be functions of spin-coefficients times Φ_{00} and partial derivatives of Φ_{00} along the null basis vectors. We obtain, for instance,

$$\begin{aligned}\Xi_{10'} &= \frac{1}{3}(\Phi_{00,l} - \Phi_{00,k}) + \frac{1}{3}[\bar{\mu} - 2\hat{\mu} - \hat{\rho} + 2\bar{\rho} - 2(\gamma + \bar{\gamma})]\Phi_{00}, \\ \Xi_{11'} &= \frac{1}{3}\Phi_{00,m} + \frac{1}{3}[2\bar{\pi} - 2\kappa - \bar{\nu} + \tau]\Phi_{00},\end{aligned}\tag{20}$$

where the usual ρ and μ of the Newman-Penrose formalism have been written $\hat{\rho}$ and $\hat{\mu}$, to avoid confusion with matter variables.

For the perfect fluid case, as we would expect from inspection of the matter terms in (8)-(11), the number of algebraically independent quantities in Ξ drops to 11 (real) components. In detail, we find that $\Xi_{10'} - \Xi_{21'}$ is real, $\Xi_{01'} = \overline{\Xi_{30'}}$ and $3(\Xi_{11'} - \overline{\Xi_{20'}}) = \Xi_{00'} - \overline{\Xi_{31'}}$ (5 real equations).

Through the ONT-null tetrad transformation, (12), the fluid kinematic quantities can be expressed in terms of spin-coefficients. Direct calculation shows that, taking $(\mu + p)$ as known from the Riemann tensor itself, the free quantities in Ξ can be taken as the 5 σ_{ab} , the 3 ω_a and the three combinations $(\mu + p)_{,\alpha} + \dot{u}_\alpha(\mu + p)$. Since Ξ contains only $(\mu + p)$ it cannot yield the right side of (9) directly. In terms of the Weyl tensor, choosing the free quantities in Ξ is equivalent to specifying the 5 time derivatives of E_{ab} , $\dot{E}_{ab}$, and 6 divergences of E_{ab} and H_{ab} , $(\text{div}E)_a$, $(\text{div}H)_a$, taking matter to be free.

As examples of these relations, we give

$$\begin{aligned}6\sqrt{2}(\Xi_{10'} + \overline{\Xi_{10'}}) &= -2((\mu + p)_{,3} + \dot{u}_3(\mu + p)) - 3\sigma_{33}(\mu + p) \\ \sqrt{2}i(\Xi_{10'} - \overline{\Xi_{10'}}) &= -\omega_{12}(\mu + p) = -\omega_3(\mu + p), \\ \sqrt{2}i(\Xi_{01'} - \overline{\Xi_{01'}}) &= -\sigma_{12}(\mu + p).\end{aligned}\tag{21}$$

In the general case, there are also 16 (real) algebraically independent quantities in the (ii) in Section 3, i.e. $\nabla_{(X}{}^{(X'}\Phi_{AB)}{}^{A'B')}$ (the totally symmetrized spinor derivative of the Ricci spinor). In our case, these quantities take the form

$$\begin{aligned}\nabla\Phi_{00'} &= \Phi_{00,k} - 2(\varepsilon + \bar{\varepsilon})\Phi_{00} \\ \nabla\Phi_{01'} &= \frac{1}{3}\Phi_{00,m} + \frac{2}{3}(-\bar{\alpha} - \beta - \bar{\pi} + \kappa)\Phi_{00} \\ &\dots\end{aligned}\tag{22}$$

One component $(\nabla\Phi_{03'})$ is zero, while the others obey the 5 real identities given by $\nabla\Phi_{02'} = \nabla\Phi_{13'}$, $3(\nabla\Phi_{01'} + \nabla\Phi_{23'}) = \nabla\Phi_{12'}$ and $\nabla\Phi_{00'} + 9\nabla\Phi_{22'} = 9\nabla\Phi_{11'} + \nabla\Phi_{33'}$, so that for a perfect fluid are only 9 independent real components within $\nabla\Phi$. By direct calculation, we find that these 9 independent quantities can be given by the 5 σ_{ab} , 3 expressions $(\mu + p)_{,\alpha} - 2\dot{u}_\alpha(\mu + p)$, and $(\mu + p) - 2\Theta(\mu + p)/3$.

For example, we find

$$\begin{aligned} 4\sqrt{2}(\nabla\Phi)_{00'} &= (\mu + p)_{,3} - 2\dot{u}_3(\mu + p) + (\mu + p) - (\tfrac{2}{3}\Theta + 2\sigma_{33})(\mu + p), \\ 12\sqrt{2}(\nabla\Phi)_{01'} &= (\mu + p)_{,1} - 2\dot{u}_1(\mu + p) - 4\sigma_{31}(\mu + p) \\ &\quad - i[(\mu + p)_{,2} - 2\dot{u}_2(\mu + p) - 4\sigma_{23}(\mu + p)]. \end{aligned}$$

The 5 independent real relations between components of Ξ and $\nabla\Phi$ implied by the fact that each gives the 5 σ_{ab} can be expressed as $3\nabla\Phi_{02'} = 2\Xi_{01'}$; $3(\nabla\Phi_{23'} - \nabla\Phi_{01'}) = 6\Xi_{11'} - 2\Xi_{00'}$; and $\Xi_{10'} + \overline{\Xi_{10'}} - (\Xi_{21'} + \overline{\Xi_{21'}}) = 6\nabla\Phi_{11'} - 3\nabla\Phi_{22'} - \nabla\Phi_{00'}$. Thus $(\mu + p)$, Ξ and $\nabla\Phi$ together give the following 15 fluid derivative quantities: the 5 σ_{ab} , 3 ω_a , 3 $\dot{u}_a$, 3 $(\mu + p)_{,\alpha}$ and $(\mu + p) - 2\Theta(\mu + p)/3$. [Of course, where we take the independent quantities to occur and which are then regarded as dependent is not uniquely defined.]

For a perfect fluid, the partial derivatives of Λ , (iii) in Section 3, are related to the partial derivatives of $\Phi_{00'}$, via the contracted Bianchi identities (2) which can be written

$$\begin{aligned} \Phi_{00',l} - \Phi_{00',k} &= 6(\Lambda_{,l} - \Lambda_{,k}) + 4[(\gamma + \bar{\gamma}) + (\varepsilon + \bar{\varepsilon})]\Phi_{00'}, \\ \Phi_{00',m} &= 6\Lambda_{,m} + 2[-\bar{\nu} + \kappa - \bar{\pi} + \tau]\Phi_{00'}, \\ \Phi_{00',l} + \Phi_{00',k} &= -2(\Lambda_{,l} + \Lambda_{,k}) + \tfrac{4}{3}[(\gamma + \bar{\gamma}) - (\varepsilon + \bar{\varepsilon}) - (\hat{\mu} + \bar{\hat{\mu}}) + (\hat{\rho} + \bar{\hat{\rho}})]\Phi_{00'}. \end{aligned} \tag{23}$$

In general the four derivatives of Λ are mutually independent.

For a perfect fluid

$$\begin{aligned} 4\sqrt{2}(\Lambda_{,m} + \Lambda_{,\bar{m}}) &= \tfrac{1}{3}\mu_{,1} - p_{,1}, \\ 4\sqrt{2}i(\Lambda_{,m} - \Lambda_{,\bar{m}}) &= \tfrac{1}{3}\mu_{,2} - p_{,2}, \\ 4\sqrt{2}(\Lambda_{,k} - \Lambda_{,l}) &= \tfrac{1}{3}\mu_{,3} - p_{,3}. \end{aligned}$$

so the Bianchi identities enable us to separate the spatial derivatives of μ and p . We have one remaining free quantity,

$$12\sqrt{2}(\Lambda_{,k} + \Lambda_{,l}) = \dot{\mu} - 3\dot{p},$$

which together with the remaining Bianchi identity (the last in (23)) and $(\mu + p) - 2\Theta(\mu + p)/3$ enables us to obtain $\dot{p}$, $\dot{\mu}$ and Θ separately. We now have all the fluid quantities in spinor form.

To summarize, we have shown that for the perfect fluid case the set of quantities (ii)–(iv), i.e. $\nabla\Phi$, $\nabla\Lambda$ and Ξ , contains 16 algebraically independent real quantities (as functions of spin-coefficients times $\Phi_{00'}$ and partial derivatives of $\Phi_{00'}$ in the basis 1-forms), which is the same number as calculated for the data characterizing the non-locally free part of ∇R in the 1 + 3 formalism, and the two sets are equivalent.

5 Summary

By decomposing the gradient of the curvature ∇R in the perfect fluid case we can identify the 24 Maartens *et al.* [1] locally free data (curls and *distortions* of the electric and magnetic part of the Weyl tensor) with the $\nabla\Psi$ quantities in the approach to the equivalence problem [3]. The remaining quantities in the first derivatives of the curvature, which can be given by the 16 algebraically independent matter variables given by the derivatives of μ and p , Θ , σ_{ab} , $\dot{u}_c$ and ω_a , constrained by the contracted Bianchi identities, were explicitly shown to be fully equivalent to the remaining Ξ , $\nabla\Phi$ and $\nabla\Lambda$ in the spinor treatment [3]. Together these give a full ONT - NP identification of the $24 + 16 = 40$ free quantities characterizing ∇R , for the perfect fluid case.

References

- [1] Maartens R, Ellis G F R and Siklos S T C 1997 *Class. Quantum Grav.* **14** 1927
- [2] Stephani H, Kramer D, MacCallum M A H, Hoenselaers C A, and Herlt E 2003 *Exact solutions of Einstein's field equations, second edition* Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- [3] MacCallum M A H and Åman J E 1986 *Class. Quantum Grav.* **3** 1133
- [4] Penrose R 1960 *Ann. Phys., NY* **10** 171
- [5] Skea J E F 2000 *Class. Quantum Grav.* **17** L69